



City of Cleveland

Justin M. Bibb, Mayor

City Planning Commission



Joyce Pan Huang, Director

Cleveland City Hall

601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 501

Cleveland, Ohio 44114

T: (216) 664-2210 F: (216) 664-3281 | www.planning.clevelandohio.gov

RE: Public Comments Received for Sherwin HQ (DF2021-016) Streetscape, Landscape, Lighting, Signage to be reviewed at 6/2/22 Joint DR and 6/3/22 Joint CPC Landmarks

STREETSCAPE, SEATING, TRANSIT

Am I wrong, or are there no benches planned for the Sherwin Williams plaza you are discussing on Friday?

Can you tell me if they explained in a past meeting why they were not including any? I thought we wanted a living city, where people can sit and have coffee and eat lunch and chat!

Thanks,
Jeff Barge

Superior Ave, between W Roadway and W 6th St, is one of the busiest transit waiting environments in the State of Ohio. Every day, thousands of riders use this space—directly in front of the proposed Sherwin-Williams headquarters—to wait for, board, alight from, and transfer between public buses.

On behalf of the 25% of Cleveland households without a car, Clevelanders for Public Transit is deeply concerned that the proposed streetscape design does not include a single bench, seating area, or other improvements for riders on Superior Ave. Riders demand comfort and dignity when waiting for the bus. This space must include expanded shelter and additional seating, as well as rider necessities like more trash cans, befitting the importance of public transit to the City of Cleveland.

Alex Rubin
Coordinating Committee, Clevelanders for Public Transit



URBAN DESIGN, MISC.

- 1.) There is a lot of "prime real estate" being used for surface parking lots! This seems to go against city policy where approvals are frequently granted for many apartments and multi-family housing units with less than one parking space per unit and no visitor parking in many of our urban ("hot") neighborhoods! I believe all parking for this project should be below ground, with a very few visitor spaces above ground.
- 2) Won't most of the employees in these buildings be using public transportation, so parking lots of these sizes shouldn't be needed? (This is another justification we hear from developers to plead their cases for #1 above, and this reasoning seems valid as the developments with little to no parking are approved by city departments.)
- 3.) The landscaping plan will not "hide" this ocean of cars in surface parking lots downtown.
- 4.) Another tall building was proposed at the Engineer's garage site, under the bridge. It has the same cut-out as this tower. I would think the Sherwin Williams building would be more unique with more striking architecture.

Thank you for your consideration,
Paulette Colarochio



BIRD-FRIENDLINESS

As a concerned citizen of Cuyahoga County and a long-time bird-watcher, I am writing to submit my personal comments before your meeting at the end of November. I understand these comments will be added to others from the public before the architects' plans for the new Sherwin-Williams headquarters complex in downtown Cleveland are reviewed and granted final approval. Most of all I want to learn about the glass to be used in the construction of the office tower and adjacent buildings. How much is there and, most importantly, what kind of glass will be used? Is that information available to the public now?

By choosing bird-friendly glass before construction begins, the new Sherwin-Williams headquarters will help birds survive as they migrate through Cleveland, not kill more of them. Here is a quote from a recent article:

Bird-safe designs are critical architectural and design requirements in modern commercial real estate. Across North America, new guidelines for bird-safe buildings are now the norm. LEED certification, the leading benchmark in green building, has added bird collision deterrence to its credits and reports a significant increase in interest in the program. Many metropolitan areas are making bird-friendly glass mandatory, such as Chicago, Illinois, New York, and Washington DC, in the United States and major metro areas like Toronto in Canada.

I envision Sherwin-Williams, an innovative organization, incorporating this information in its planning, obtaining LEED status and joining other buildings and companies in Cleveland's Lights Out program. Being recognized as a leader in the environmental field will be a feather in the company's hat, as well as a life saver for the millions of birds that live or migrate through Cleveland.

As a lifetime user of Sherwin-Williams paints, I ask you for your help in this life-and-death matter. Thank you for your kind consideration.

Sincerely,
Sheila Freimark
Lyndhurst, Cuyahoga County



I have been a volunteer for the Cleveland LightsOut volunteer organization for 6 years. We collect dead and injured birds and bats that strike buildings in downtown Cleveland.

Currently we cover an area approximately from Public Square to E 12th St in the early AM during spring and fall migration.

In this limited area we have collected over 12,000 birds of which approximately two thirds are dead. This is an underestimate of the actual casualties as birds are taken by scavengers such as gulls and removed by building maintenance before they can be recorded. As our name implies, light attracts birds to large cities but it is the building collisions, specifically with glass, that actually kills the birds.

Data shows that bird collisions with buildings strikes are a leading cause of migratory bird deaths. In addition, it is painfully obvious to all that monitor for LightsOut that reflective glass surfaces are the major strike points for birds. Rocket Mortgage Field House, since its renovation that included a wall of reflective glass on Huron Road, has become the major source of bird strikes and deaths in our study area.

I join with members of the Ohio Bird Conservation Initiative in requesting that the Planning Commission require Sherwin-Williams to make minor modifications to its design for their new headquarters that would include bird-safe glass on lower-level floors, especially those that reflect green space or open sky.

This small change will not compromise the designers' aesthetic vision, nor will they substantially change the costs of construction.

By incorporating glass specifically designed to reduce perceived reflectivity, Sherwin-Williams will be taking an important step to making Cleveland a safer city for migratory birds.

Sherwin-Williams can proactively reduce the number of strikes their new construction will cause by the simple change to their plans recommended above.

In the future, data on bird collisions may lead the U. S. Fish and Wildlife Service to include buildings with high bird mortality in their "incidental take of migratory birds" regulations which could result in fines or require building modification that would be more costly than the proposed modifications.

Regards,
Kent Starrett
237 E. Ridgewood Dr
Seven Hills, Ohio 44131

There appears to still be no attempts to mitigate lighting up the sky during bird migration which will result in thousands of bird strikes and quite a PR problem for them and the city of Cleveland as efforts are increasing locally and nationwide pertaining to Lights Out programs and designing with sustainability in mind.



As you can see in the link below from Cornell, Cuyahoga is #2 in the state for the highest number of birds tracked in the county and thus a magnet for bird tourists who use this site to record species. Harming birds is harming the economy of Cleveland tourism - especially during a time when some of the biggest goals in the city are about making it greener and more livable:

<https://ebird.org/region/US-OH/regions?yr=all&m=>

Please advise

Kari Warner

Concord, Ohio

(713) 819-2408

karimatsko@hotmail.com

On page 6 of the Sherwin Williams presentation

(<https://planning.clevelandohio.gov/assets/Sherwin-Williams-June%203-presentation.pdf?fbclid=IwAR3YaFLKJ096A7RLjXhi361KVIZ8t9QHJMpfu7Zdmf0yXbt58feKASi4gGc>), bullet point 4 states that the Cleveland Planning Commission wants Sherwin Williams to "Outline an avian plan and submit for review and approval by the city." It is clear the "avian consultant" hired by the architect did not address the concerns of citizens about bird safety, as the agenda for the upcoming virtual meeting presented by Sherwin Williams held jointly by the Cleveland Planning Commission and the Downtown Design Commission does not mention birds or window safety.

I volunteer for Lights Out Cleveland every migration season (spring and fall). We walk around downtown collecting live or dead birds that hit windows (birds can't see glass) and send them to the Lake Erie Nature and Science Center for data processing/rehabilitation. We usually find between 5 and 50 birds every morning, most dead on impact with the window. Almost all of these birds populations are already in decline. Up to one billion birds die each year in the United States due to collisions with windows and research shows that 54-76 percent of window collisions are fatal.

Luckily, there's still time to install pre-treated windows with aesthetically pleasing bird deterrent markers (at most 2" apart) such as those made by Walker Glass. Feather friendly commercial stickers are also aesthetically pleasing and effective if pre-treated glass isn't an option.



As research shows, the vast majority of bird collisions occur within the first stories (from birds flying from tree to perceived tree) so bird-deterrent markers would only need to be installed on the first five floors.

Sustainability is a key focus area for Sherwin Williams, with the framework centering on “**Accelerating our progress and expanding our positive impact on the world around us**”. The inclusion of bird friendly glass at their new Headquarters would exemplify their commitment to the community and to the environment while still allowing for a beautiful flagship building.

I kindly ask that you revisit this topic with Sherwin Williams!

Thank you,
Rebecca Parkes

Dear Ms. Spangler,

We are writing as concerned citizens and avid bird watchers in regard to the proposed Sherwin-Williams headquarters in downtown Cleveland. I understand that the Cleveland Planning Commission will be meeting at the end of November to review and seek final approval for the buildings and architectural materials. At this meeting I encourage the Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company’s architects use **bird-safe glass** on the buildings and **modify the building’s lighting** in the spring and fall during peak bird migration. Lighting, combined with reflections of trees and sky in reflective glass building materials, confuse migratory birds causing them to misinterpret windows leading to the collisions. Bird-safe glass and decreased lighting makes the structure visible to migratory birds, thus reducing or eliminating collisions.

Research at the Powdermill Avian Research Center in western Pennsylvania has found that birds avoid glass that has been coated with a patterned, U-V reflective glaze. The Javits Center in New York City reduced bird collisions by 90% when the building was renovated and fitted with bird-safe glass. In Cleveland, the Cleveland State University Law Library installed bird-friendly film on entryway windows with promising results. Bird-friendly glass, like other window glass products, minimizes energy consumption too.

Birds add enjoyment to our lives, are valuable as seed dispersers, plant pollinators, and play vital roles in controlling insects and rodents. Having Sherwin-Williams, a creative and well-established company, use bird-safe materials in its headquarters in downtown Cleveland would clearly show its leadership role to other companies in Cleveland, throughout Ohio, the U.S. and the world. Additionally, with the Planning Commission’s urging, the Sherwin-Williams Company would be an environmental leader - becoming a bird-friendly company in a green city on a blue lake. We also noticed the company’s slogan on their website proclaiming, “...We are committed to Building in the Good with everything we do.” We hope you



consider using bird-safe glass as one element of fulfilling Sherwin-Williams's promise. Thank you for considering this important matter.

Sincerely,
John and Judy Wilkinson
231 Green Hill Drive
Tallmadge, OH 44278
jwilkinson4@neo.rr.com

It's unconscionable that Sherwin-Williams, a global company, would be so short sighted with the design of it's world headquarters that they won't take into account the harm it will cause to birds. I suppose we shouldn't be surprised given their callous disregard for the harmful effects of lead paint.

Pat O'Connor
19001 E. Shoreland Ave. Rocky River, OH 44116-2820 (440) 895-0880

Members of the Planning Commission,

As an ornithologist with more than 20 years experience working with migratory birds, I am writing the Cleveland Planning Commission to resubmit my request that the Sherwin-Williams Company make minor modifications to its proposed design for their new headquarters that would include bird-safe glass on lower-level floors that reflect adjacent green space. These small changes will not compromise the designers' aesthetic vision, nor will they substantially change the costs of construction. However, by incorporating glass specifically designed to reduce perceived reflectivity, Sherwin-Williams will be taking an important step to making Cleveland a safer city for migratory birds. According to the conditions from the November 30, 2021 approval, Sherwin Williams were to "outline an Avian Plan and submit for review and approval by the city." No mention of such a plan is included in the [June 3, 2022 presentation packet](#). Significant attention was given to details on native plantings around the proposed campus, which will be a wonderful addition for the city's residents. However, without including plans to reduce reflectivity on adjacent glass, landscaping can exacerbate the problem and increase the number of bird-building collisions at the site.

A growing body of scientific research has documented that light from urban areas affect



decisions by migratory birds about where to stop. The Lake Erie coastline is a globally important migratory stopover location, and because of its position on the landscape and bright nighttime skyline, Cleveland attracts millions of migratory birds every year. Reflective glass in urban centers has devastating consequences to migratory birds. Collisions with buildings are a leading cause of bird fatality, and it is estimated that up to 1 billion birds die each year in North America from building collisions. In the case of Cleveland, researchers and volunteers through the Lights Out program have salvaged more than 13,000 dead and injured birds from the downtown area in just the past 5 years.

The gravity of the problem has been recognized by a growing public, including building industry professionals such as architects, developers, glass manufacturers, and landscape designers. Organizations, such as the National Glass Association, have developed standards and guidelines for bird-friendly glass design strategies, which are available online here:

<https://www.glass.org/news/2021/nga-releases-new-bird-friendly-technical-design-guide>.

Further, the American Bird Conservancy has created a database of scientifically tested glass products available for commercial and residential use: <https://abcbirds.org/glass-collisions/products-database/>. Cities across North America, beginning with Toronto and now including New York City, have enacted legislation for mandatory bird-safe building practices and materials for new construction that have reduced collisions up to 100%. Dr. Daniel Klem, a U.S. ornithologist known for his pioneering research into the mortality of birds due to glass windows, explained: “An obvious prediction, as awareness of the problem and growing solution continue to emerge, is that legislation to protect birds from sheet glass will grow accordingly until it is required everywhere.”

The Cleveland’s Planning Commission Design Guidelines, in 341.07(h) Sustainability provides: “Buildings and properties should be designed and constructed to minimize energy consumption and to promote conservation of materials and natural resources.” Birds are a natural resource, and valuable for a number of environmental and economic reasons. They spread seeds, pollinate plants, and also play a vital role in controlling insects and rodents. In addition to the countless ecological benefits, they further boost local economies via birdwatching, hunting, and ecotourism, for which Cleveland is often touted. Birdwatching is one of the fastest growing recreational activities in the United States, and Cleveland hosts a large and vibrant birding community

Having a creative company like Sherwin-Williams use bird-friendly materials in its headquarters would truly lead to Cleveland becoming a bird-friendly green city and a leader in sustainability



throughout the region and country. Thank you for considering this important matter. Please do not hesitate to contact me if I can provide any additional information or support.

Matthew B. Shumar

Co-editor, *The Second Atlas of Breeding Birds in Ohio*

Conservation Committee, Columbus Audubon

Communications Co-chair, Association of Field Ornithologists

The Avian Plan submitted by Sherwin Williams was woefully inadequate to address the concerns about migratory bird safety and we are looking for an acceptable plan from them.

We would like to see bird concerns on the agenda for Friday - unless of course this will be addressed later at an additional meeting.

An acceptable plan will be 1) a commitment to install bird-safe glass or use bird-deterrent decals on the first 75 feet of glass coming up from the ground, and 2) a commitment to keep all but necessary lights off at night during Spring & Fall migration as per the recommendations of Lights Out Cleveland.

If comments during the June 3rd meeting are allowed, I would like to comment.

I'm looking forward to working with you on the resolution of these concerns!

Patty Kellner, MD, President, Kirtland Bird Club of Northeast Ohio